# GIRDER BRIDGE





## BRIDGE REPLACEMENT WALTERDALE

Exetraedosed [n] - A girder bridge in which the tension cables are installed outside and above the main girder and deviated by short towers located at supports. A hybrid between girder and cable-stayed.

EXTRADOSED BRIDGE

CONCEPT PLANNING STUDY WALTERDALE

Arch [n] - A curved structure designed to act primarily in compression. Horizontal thrust reactions are resisted by a tension tie or embedment into the earth.

ARCH BRIDGE





## **Edmonton**



# WALTERDALE BRIDGE REPLACEMENT

CABLE-STAYED BRIDGE

Ca•ble-stayed [n] - A slender girder system cantilevered both ways from a central tower and supported by inclined cables attached to the tower.

## **Edmonton**

WALTERDALE





## **Walterdale Bridge Style Comparison Matrix**

|                          |  | Bridge Type  |  |   |  |  |
|--------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|--|
|                          | CRITERIA   | GIRDER   | EXTRADOSED   | ARCH  | CABLE STAYED   |  |
| TECHNICAL CONSIDERATIONS | Profile in North<br>Saskatchewan<br>River Valley | Low profile; you<br>wouldn't know<br>you were on a<br>bridge.                      | Slightly higher<br>profile than girder;<br>deck more<br>slender.                                     | Deck very<br>slender; arch<br>quite prominent.      | Deck very<br>slender; tower<br>about 3 times<br>higher than High<br>Level Bridge.          |  |
|                          | Impact on river                                  | Two piers in<br>river; removal of<br>existing piers.                               | Two piers in river;<br>removal of<br>existing piers.   | No piers in river;<br>removal of<br>existing piers. | No piers in river;<br>removal of<br>existing piers.  |  |
|                          | Impact on south river bank                       | New abutment, removal of existing abutment.  |  |   | New abutment and pylon on south bank.  New large tiedown block.  Remove existing abutment. |  |
|                          | Impact on north river bank                       | New abutment, removal of existing abutment.  |  |   |  |  |
|                          | Utilities<br>integration                         | Utilities should fit between girders.      Utilities may be east walk and          |  |   | rried in box between<br>I barrier.   |  |
|                          | Constructability                                 | Common bridge<br>type. Space may<br>be required to<br>launch girders<br>from bank. | <ul> <li>Less common<br/>bridge type.</li> <li>Slightly more<br/>complex than<br/>girder.</li> </ul> | Arch erection complex.     Deck easy to erect.      | Very tall tower.     Deck easy to erect.   |  |









|               |  | Bridge Type   |  |   |   |  |
|---------------|--|---|--|---|---|--|
|               | CRITERIA   | GIRDER  | EXTRADOSED   | ARCH  | CABLE STAYED  |  |
| ACCESSIBILITY | Pedestrian<br>experience<br>and safety                         | <ul> <li>Minimal<br/>separation<br/>between<br/>pedestrians and<br/>vehicles.</li> <li>Higher above<br/>water unless<br/>pedestrian<br/>walkway is a<br/>separate<br/>element.</li> </ul>                             | <ul> <li>Enhanced buffer<br/>between roadway<br/>and pedestrians<br/>due to cable<br/>structure.</li> <li>Higher above<br/>water.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Enhanced buffer between roadway and pedestrians due to cable structure.</li> <li>Lower to water.</li> </ul>              | Enhanced buffer between roadway and pedestrians due to cable structure.      Lower to water.                                      |  |
|               | Bicycle<br>experience<br>and safety                            | <ul> <li>Minimal separation between pedestrians and vehicles.</li> <li>Higher above water unless pedestrian walkway is a separate element.</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Enhanced buffer<br/>between roadway<br/>and bicycles due<br/>to cable structure.</li> <li>Higher above<br/>water.</li> </ul>        | <ul> <li>Enhanced buffer<br/>between<br/>roadway and<br/>bicycles due to<br/>cable structure.</li> <li>Lower to water.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Enhanced buffer<br/>between<br/>roadway and<br/>bicycles due to<br/>cable structure.</li> <li>Lower to water.</li> </ul> |  |
|               | Access to<br>Kinsmen Sports<br>Centre                          | Bridge type does not impact access.   |  |   |   |  |
|               | Access to<br>Rossdale<br>Generating<br>Station                 | Bridge type does not impact vehicular access.   |  |   |   |  |
|               | Access/<br>integration with<br>north multi-use<br>trail system | <ul> <li>Structural design allows higher elevation for trail and promenade (closer to existing elevation).</li> <li>Structure has potential to be split to reduce impact of bridge widths on trails below.</li> </ul> | Structural design<br>allows higher<br>elevation for trail<br>and promenade<br>(closer to existing<br>elevation).                             | Structural design requires lower trail and promenade.   |   |  |
|               | Access/<br>integration with<br>south multi-use<br>trial system | <ul> <li>Bridge higher on south bank.</li> <li>Rail system can be generous and fully integrated.</li> </ul>   |  | Bridge lower to<br>river and will<br>require a<br>technical solution<br>to incorporate<br>trail below<br>bridge.                  | Tower proximity to water's edge impacts trail.  Difficult to incorporate promenade under bridge unless bridge deck is raised.     |  |











|             |                | Bridge Type                              |            |      |              |  |
|-------------|----------------|--|------------|------|--------------|--|
|             | CRITERIA       | GIRDER                                   | EXTRADOSED | ARCH | CABLE STAYED |  |
| CONSTRAINTS | Legislative    | Commentary to form part of final report. |            |      |              |  |
|             | Regulatory     | Commentary to form part of final report. |            |      |              |  |
|             | Geotechnical   | Commentary to form part of final report. |            |      |              |  |
|             | Archaeological | Commentary to form part of final report. |            |      |              |  |
|             | Environmental  | Commentary to form part of final report. |            |      |              |  |











|                               |  | Bridge Type   |   |   |  |  |
|-------------------------------|--|---|---|---|--|--|
|                               | CRITERIA   | GIRDER  | EXTRADOSED  | ARCH  | CABLE STAYED   |  |
| ADJACENT PROJECTS/INITIATIVES | Kinsmen<br>Sports Centre   | Bridge design has no apparent impact.   |   |   |  |  |
|                               | Burial Grounds   | Bridge profile has<br>little visual<br>impact.  | Lower profile of<br>towers has low<br>visual impact.  | Height of arch<br>has strong visual<br>impact. May<br>reduce visual<br>presence of<br>burial grounds.                       | Height of tower<br>and cable system<br>has strong<br>vertical presence.<br>May reduce<br>visual presence<br>of burial grounds. |  |
|                               | Interpretive<br>Display  | <ul> <li>Bridge design has no apparent impact.</li> <li>Road alignment may require a re-location of Interpretive Display.</li> </ul>                    |   |   |  |  |
|                               | West Rossdale<br>Urban Design<br>Plan  | <ul> <li>Good opportunity to complement strong<br/>public realm design and enhanced<br/>relationship to water's edge.</li> </ul>                        |   | Higher degree of visual presence as to potential to reduce importance of public realm.                                      |  |  |
|                               | Impact on repurposing of Rossdale Generating Station including Pumphouse 1 & 2 | Low visual profile<br>provides<br>opportunity to<br>open views to<br>and from the site,<br>and create a<br>strong presence<br>for the Power<br>Station. | Superstructure desi<br>the Power Station a  | sign potentially diminishes the presence of and obscures views to and from the site.  |  |  |
|                               | Impact<br>on/relationship<br>to Legislature<br>Grounds                         | Low visual profile<br>provides<br>opportunity to<br>open views to<br>site.  | Superstructure is<br>below south lawn<br>but obscures<br>sustained views<br>to Legislature. | <ul> <li>Superstructure is above south lawn of<br/>Legislature.</li> <li>Obscures sustained view to Legislature.</li> </ul> |  |  |











|               |  | Bridge Type  |  |   |              |  |
|---------------|--|--|--|---|--------------|--|
|               | CRITERIA   | GIRDER   | EXTRADOSED   | ARCH  | CABLE STAYED |  |
| OPPORTUNITIES | Watercraft use<br>of river                                 | Piers in water may   | impact watercraft.   | No piers in water will enhance use of river by watercraft.  |              |  |
|               | Wildlife passage   | Bridge type choice has no impact.  |  |   |              |  |
|               | Functional<br>Signature<br>Opportunity -<br>point of pride | Simple structural design creates opportunity for unique, innovative approach to signature focused on public realm and integration into valley. | <ul> <li>Stronger visual statement inherent with tower and cables.</li> <li>Some opportunity for enhanced public realm and integration into valley.</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Very strong visual impact of bridge type will be signature in and of itself.</li> <li>Public realm somewhat diminished in importance.</li> </ul> |              |  |
| COST          | Capital cost   | • Lowest.  | Medium.  | Highest.  | Medium.      |  |
|               | Operating & maintenance costs                              | Commentary to form part of final report.   |  |   |              |  |
|               | Life cycle cost  | Commentary to form part of final report.   |  |   |              |  |







