

Jurisdiction Scan

Administration has reviewed a number of Cash in Lieu of Parking programs using publicly available documents online from several Canadian jurisdictions, as listed in Table 1. The jurisdiction scan is non-exhaustive and represents a high-level overview of the approach to Cash in Lieu of Parking programs. An analysis of the legal framework for each province was not completed, and as a result the approach from other areas may not be directly comparable.

Overall, the scan identified that these programs are designed to deliver the total number of parking spaces required by the Zoning Bylaw within a designated area. Other findings include:

- The programs typically apply only to high density, walkable areas.
- Some municipalities require that the fee be evaluated on a project-by-project basis, with different ways of assessing the fee required:
 - Council to approve the cash in lieu amount (full Council discretion, case by case review by administration);
 - A parking report from a transportation engineer;
 - No set evaluation criteria and no clear guidelines or governance.
- Some municipalities have a set fee for all developments with different approaches to updating the fee:
 - An annual evaluation of the current construction cost with updates according to an inflation index.
 - A one time fee setting - in one case fees have not been updated since inception in 1988.
- The jurisdiction scan found that municipalities typically under-charge for Cash in Lieu of Parking spaces, resulting in insufficient capital to advance construction.

Of all jurisdictions surveyed, Vancouver's program seemed to best align with the objectives of the CR_7227 motion. The program also has a clear governance structure for how the funds are to be determined, collected, distributed, waived, and administered. Funds are not permitted to be used for general revenue and there is an annual update to fees to ensure appropriate funds are collected. Vancouver's Cash in Lieu program also features a "green transportation reserve", which allows the funds to be used for bike and transit infrastructure.

In contrast, the City of Ottawa had a Cash in Lieu of Parking program but disbanded it in 2015 due to ineffectiveness. Ottawa found that the fees being charged per parking space were insufficient to cover the cost of building parking structures in a timely fashion, and did not find support to periodically raise fees to meet construction costs. It could take decades to accumulate enough funds to build a parking facility, and when the structure was built there was often a perceived lack of fairness if the location did not serve all of those who had paid

into the fund. Finally, the program created a barrier to small businesses and small developers, who were disproportionately affected by the fees compared to larger developers.

Applicability to Edmonton:

Section 651 of the *Alberta Municipal Government Act* does not allow cash in lieu of parking fees to be used for system benefits. Any program in Alberta would likely be limited to delivery of parking facilities in the general vicinity of a contributing development. This could serve to limit the effectiveness of the program in terms of contributions and delivery.

If a source of revenue is desired to support transit and other non-automobile infrastructure, or as a “parking benefit district” that benefits the patrons of a specific area, then an alternative revenue structure is required, such as a development levy.

Table 1: Summary of Cash in Lieu of Parking programs in Canada

Jurisdiction	Proposed Cash In Lieu Rate Per Parking Space	Expected Cost To Build	Other Fees
Banff, AB	\$21,000.00 The rate will change annually based on Alberta’s Non-Residential Building Construction Price Index	Actual cost may be much higher than \$21,000. The cost of providing future structured parking stalls will be shared between developer contributions and the community at large	not mentioned
Calgary, AB	50% of the estimated cost to construct a prototypical parkade (i.e. 486 stalls in an enclosed above ground structure)	The cost of such a stall shall be estimated by an independent engineering firm familiar with parkade design and construction retained by the City	not mentioned
Canmore, AB	80% of estimated cost of providing a new parking space. Town provides the land.	\$50,000 (2011), as determined by the Town of Canmore	not mentioned
New Westminster, BC	\$11,000 (1988) \$35,000 (2008) \$25,000 structured/ \$8,000 surface (2011)	\$12,000 to \$15,000 (1988) \$35,000 (2008)	“set the fee for the potential for cost recovery of program

Attachment 2

			administration”
Vancouver, BC	\$24,700.00 (2018)	\$24,700.00	Not mentioned
Vernon, BC	\$10,000 per space up to 50% of the required parking supply. Up to 100% where there are confirmed plans to develop public parking in close proximity to the site or at sites with significant constraints	not mentioned	not mentioned
Barrie, ON	\$15,000 (2012) \$2,500 (2011)	not mentioned	not mentioned
Gananoque, ON	\$500 upfront plus \$50 annually (2015)	\$3,500 to \$4,000 per space, which excludes land costs	application fee in the amount of \$1,000 payable to the Town of Gananoque
Halton Hills, ON	\$5,000.00 (2013) This value represents about 35% of the average land acquisition and construction cost for a parking space in the Town	Main Street – Georgetown \$475,000/20 = \$23,750 Edith Street – Georgetown \$1,040,000/66 = \$15,758 Main St./Willow Street - Acton \$440,000/51 = \$8,627 The average cost of providing a parking space is approximately \$14,270	not mentioned
Hamilton, ON	\$32,000/4=\$8,000 (2006) \$22,269/7=\$3,181 (2004) 50% of cost to provide parking spaces (incl. land value and construction costs)	not mentioned	not mentioned

Attachment 2

Kawartha Lakes, ON	No standard rate \$1,379, (2007) \$763, (2009) \$1,500, (2015) \$2,200, (2019)	\$4,000, (2009) (Fenelon Falls)	development charges (DCs)
Kingston, ON	\$3,000.00 (1992 - By-law No. 95-259) By-law No. 88-270	not mentioned	not mentioned
Kitchener, ON	\$20,000 (1990) \$35,000 (2008) Based on the cost shown in a 2002 RFP to construct a parking space in a parking structure. 4% per year increase to 2008	Above grade parkade: \$30,000 (2008) Below grade parkade: \$40,000 (2008)	not mentioned
Milton, ON	\$7,728 (2013) \$7,365 (2011) \$21,429/3 = \$7,143 (2009)	"The Cash in Lieu rate is to be updated each time it is used to calculate a fee."	not mentioned
Mississauga, ON	\$14,500 (2009)	\$14,500 to provide a surface parking stall in the City Centre; \$29,000 for a multi-storey above grade parkade (2009)	not mentioned
Oakville, ON	50% of estimated cost of providing a new parking space.	Estimate that a space in an above ground parkade is \$30,000 to \$50,000. (2009)	not mentioned
Ottawa, ON	Disbanded their Cash in Lieu of Parking program. While the program was in operation, the fees were set by use, and whether they were inside or outside the core.	not mentioned	\$2593 fee to review the documents.

Attachment 2

Richmond Hill, ON	50% of cost of land + construction cost. Varies if surface parking or for multi-level parking. When parking demand exceeds 85% of capacity, funds collected be directed to the provision of additional parking infrastructure.	not mentioned	not mentioned
Toronto, ON	\$0 \$5,000.00 (2017) \$19,240.25 (2001)	Determined on an application by application basis	\$346.36 plus HST application processing fee
	Gross Floor Area <=200 sq. m - \$2,500 Gross Floor Area >200 sq. m <= 400 sq. m - \$5,000 Gross Floor Area > 400 sq. m – [\$5,000 + \$(5 x L)] L= current estimated land value in \$ per sq. m	Based on current estimated cost of construction of a surface parking stall (i.e. \$5,000) Gross Floor Area >400 sq. m includes land acquisition cost	